



RESULTS OF MONITORING OF IMPLEMENTATION OF STATE POLICY ON PROTECTION OF CHILDREN FROM VIOLENCE AND ABUSE

(brief report)

Bishkek, 2016

Results of monitoring of implementation of state policy on protection of children from violence and abuse

Bishkek: 2016.

This publication is a result of monitoring of state policy on protection of children from violence and abuse, which was conducted by Public Fund “Child’s Rights Defenders League” in the framework of the Project “Monitoring of State Policy on Protection of Children from Violence and Abuse” with financial support of Democracy Commission of US Embassy in the Kyrgyz Republic.

Public Fund “Child’s Rights Defenders League” expresses gratitude and special thanks to Vice-Prime Minister of the Kyrgyz Republic Kudaiberdieva Gulmira Karimovna for assistance in conducting this monitoring.

Head of the Study: N.Turdubekova

Composers: N.Turdubekova, N.Alymbaev, N. Dzhakubova

Study team: Z.Eshmuratova, M.Anarbaeva, O.Dzhumashova, B.Kaparova, D.Davletbaeva, S.Saltanova, S.Ilyasova, G.Nurmambetova, E.Alieva.

Content of the report

List of abbreviations

Introduction.....

Chapter 1. Methodology of the report.....

1.1. Purpose and objectives.....

1.2. Tools of report preparation.....

Chapter 2. Analysis of national legislation for compliance with international standards for protection of children from violence and abuse

2.1. International standards for protection of children from violence and abuse

2.2. Analysis of national legislation for compliance with international standards for protection of children from violence and abuse

2.3. Results of analysis of the State Program of development of justice for children in in Kyrgyz Republic for 2014-2018

2.4. Conclusions and recommendations

Chapter 3. Evaluation of implementation of state policy on protection of children from violence and abuse

3.1. Assessment of practice of state agencies and local public authorities on prevention of violence and organization of social support for children, affected by violence (implementation of inter-agency plans on prevention, identification and social support for children, affected by violence and abuse and Regulation “On procedure for identification of children and families in difficult life situations”)

3.2. Conclusions and recommendations

Introduction

One of important issues, related to child rights violation in the Kyrgyz Republic, is violence of children and abuse of them. Violence and neglecting basic needs of child are any acts or failures to act on the part of parents, guardians or other adults, resulting in impaired health and well-being of child or conditions, hindering his optimal physical or mental development, are created, his rights and freedom are violated. Depending on nature of prevailing child injury, there are following forms of abuse: physical abuse, psychological violence, sexual abuse and neglecting basic needs of child. These problems have a high urgency and priority for Kyrgyzstan.

According to multiple indicator cluster survey (UNICEF and Committee on National Statistics) in 2014 – 57.1% of surveyed children are punished by a family member, of which 40.8% have experienced physical punishment, including 2.8% - violent forms of punishment.

To prevent violence and abuse against children, protection of their rights and promoting family values, state bodies of the Kyrgyz Republic conducts focused policy, which includes also an implementation of international obligations in this area. Given that now, Comprehensive Program on Supporting Family and Protection of Children is developing for the first time in the country, the urgency of this Report on monitoring of implementation of current state policy is increasing, because there is a real opportunity to submit recommendations and suggestions in time for including into the final document.

The Report consists of three chapters. It should be noted the independence of preparing the second and third chapters, which contain specific conclusions and recommendations.

The first chapter of the Report presents methodology of preparation of the Report, purpose and its objectives, tools of analysis and monitoring.

The second chapter provides an overview of international standards of protection of children from violence and abuse, as well as an analysis of compliance of national legislation to them. Paragraph 2.2 “Review of national legislation for compliance with international standards for protection of children from violence and abuse” was used from “Analysis of national legislation on protection of children from violence and for compliance with international standards”, conducted by Public Fund “Child’s Rights Defenders League” with support of UNICEF in Kyrgyzstan (2014)

The analysis has been prepared for purposes of:

- compliance of national legislation with international standards;
- systematization of provisions of legislation and legal requirements, regulating issues of protection of children from violence and abuse;
- making recommendations on improving national legislation and practice of its application by addressing identified gaps and controversies.

This chapter also presents an analysis of the State Program on juvenile justice and conclusions and recommendations on improvement of national legislation are drawn. Results of analysis of the first chapter can be used in practice by general public: state agencies, international and non-governmental organizations, all, who are interested in changing the situation of child rights and protection from violence.

The third chapter is devoted to analysis of practice of state bodies in protection of children from violence and abuse, as well as recommendations on improving efficiency of existing system of protection of children's rights are presented. It is greatly emphasized on implementation of Regulation "On procedure for identification of children and families in difficult life situations", approved by Resolution of the Government No. 391 from June 22, 2015. In addition, role and functions of Authorized Body on protection of children, specifics of its activities are defined, an overview of forms of work of regional experts on combating violence and abuse is provided.

Chapter 3. Evaluation of implementation of state policy on protection of children from violence and abuse

3.1. Assessment of practice of state agencies and local public authorities on prevention of violence and organization of social support for children, affected by violence (implementation of inter-agency plans on prevention, identification and social support for children, affected by violence and abuse and Regulation "On procedure for identification of children and families in difficult life situations")

Awareness of state and local authorities on prevention of ill-treatment, identification and social support of families and children in difficult life situations

Monitoring has showed that, in state agencies, there are working folders, including state programs, regulatory legal acts, regulations, departmental and local orders for prevention of child abuse (except Bazar-Korgon district, where they could not provide texts of regulatory legal acts on protection of families and children). According to requirements of record keeping, documents are divided into thematic folders.

In interviews, respondents were able to name main regulations on protection of children and families.

Thus, specialists of social sphere at the district level are informed of current state policy on protection of rights of children and families in difficult life situations, as well as from violence and abuse of children.

However, this information has been insufficient for local public authorities. For example, (14.8%) of respondents, heads of village administrations, could not present regulatory legal acts for prevention of violence among children.

Information about Regulation No. 391 on the Procedure for identification of families and children in difficult life situations was not disclosed to all district structures (Local Education Authorities, Family Practice Centers, Youth Liaison Services and others) and to all employees of PCFD.

3.1.1. Implementation of the Action Plan for prevention of abuse and violence against children in 2015-2017 (according to the Decree of the Government of the KR No. 125-p)

In accordance with the Decree of the Government of KR of March 25, No. 125-p, in all district state administrations and local public authorities there are approved interagency Action Plans to prevent child abuse and violence against children in 2015-2017, on the basis of which, measures are being taken for prevention of ill-treatment of children.

The Action Plan for prevention of abuse and violence against children in 2015- 2017 contains the following sections:

1. Implementation of national awareness raising campaigns for prevention of abuse and violence against children.
2. Organization of work on early identification of families and children in difficult life condition.
3. Increase of efficiency of public bodies and local public authorities to prevent abuse and violence against children.
4. Ensuring availability and increasing efficiency of assistance in cases of abuse and violence against children.

Plans, approved by heads of district state administrations and mayors of cities, are distributed to appropriate services and ayil okmotu (village administrations). For example, in Bishkek, in all districts, there is an interagency plan for prevention of offences among minors, a work plan to identify children and families in difficult life situations, including plans for raids, information activities, and work plans of working groups at Municipal Territorial Administrations. Based on republican plan of emergency measures to eliminate violence against children, intradistrict similar plans are approved. In districts, in akimiats, head offices for elimination of violence against children are established (except Sokuluk district, where there is no head office), whose members are heads of structural divisions of the district (Ministry of Labor and Social Development, Ministry of Internal Affairs, Ministry of Health, Ministry of Education & Science). Regular meetings of head offices are conducted and minutes are taken, executive secretaries of head offices are responsible for documenting. List of issues included prevention of violence and organization of work to identify cases of violence. Minutes of meetings of head offices in Naryn, Kara-Suu and Bazar-Korgon districts have not been provided.

District interagency action plans for prevention of abuse and violence against children in 2015-2017 include paragraphs of information-advocacy and promotion of family values among population (an exception – Uzgen district of Osh oblast).

Monitoring showed that information campaigns on prevention violence are carried out primarily at the level of secondary schools and with few exceptions have a different form in form of discussions at village meetings and actions at the district level. For example: Kara-Kuldja district of Osh oblast, in addition to school activities for prevention of violence among children, 4 information actions have been conducted at the district level. In Kara-Suu district, round tables in schools jointly with district state administration,

district department of education, youth liaison services, district management unit of social development, local public authorities.

In Chui oblast, there is a practice of discussion on violence prevention among children at the level of village meetings (Issyk-Ata, Sokuluk, Panfilov, Kemin, Alamudun districts).

In some districts, an information explanatory work on prevention of violence is limited only by schools (stands, seminars for social workers, parents' meetings, competitions, etc.):

- Kyzyl-Kiya town, Kadamzhai and Batken district of Batken oblast;
- Jalal-Abad town, Suzak and Bazar-Korgon districts of Jalal-Abad oblast;
- Issyk-Kul, Aksu, Tyup districts of Issyk-Kul oblast;
- Naryn town,
- Osh town.

Despite the fact that district management units of social development should carry out basic coordination on promotion family values and positive parenting, in fact, social workers, teachers and employees of youth liaison services are also involved in prevention of abuse. However, rural clubs and libraries are practically not involved in formation of family values and inadmissibility of child abuse.

In local media, radio- and television programs, positive examples of family values, responsible attitude to education of child are not sufficiently in practice.

According to the Decree of the Government of the KR No. 125-p, the Action Plan includes organization of work for early detection of families and children in difficult life conditions, particularly, conducting household survey of families in order to identify children left without parental care and children of internal and external migrants. Household surveys were held in all districts. Particular attention was paid to areas of compact settlement of migrants (new housing developments). Household surveys were conducted by social workers of district management units of social development of Ministry of Labor and Social Development and municipal territorial administrations/local public authorities, specialists of district management units of social development of Ministry of Labor and Social Development and school staff. In addition, some household surveys were carried out in Bishkek by youth liaison services and authorized local inspectors of some districts (specifically, in Pervomaysky district, on summer vacation, youth liaison services surveyed 30 000 households).

The monitoring group notes that during household survey, in addition to identifying abused children, other categories of children in difficult life conditions are identified – children, who do not attend schools, do not have personal documents, and children without parental care). Respondents from district management units of social development of Ministry of Labor and Social Development and youth liaison services noted that schools could conduct more active work on identification of children, victims of violence, as they see children every day, they know situation in families. The same can be said about police inspectors – they come across on their territories with vulnerable families and persons, conducting asocial way of life, but do not provide information to youth liaison services and social services.

In the section of the Action Plan for early identification of families and children in difficult life conditions, it is indicated training (medical workers, social teachers, employees of city and district management units on social development, social workers) on issues of prevention of child abuse, providing psychological assistance to children, victims of violence. Monitoring showed that Ministry of Labor and Social Development of the KR jointly with International Labor Organization, in 2015-2016, has trained employees of district management units on social development of 6 oblasts, as well as secretaries of commissions on children's affairs on implementation of Regulation No. 391 on the Procedure for identification of families and children in difficult life situations, where the category of children, victims and witnesses of violence was included, but this training is not sufficient. Training was also conducted in several districts by Public Fund "Child's Rights Defenders League". Specialists pointed out that they need in targeted training with participation of psychologists and medical workers at system level for prevention of violence or provision of services to victims, witnesses of violence.

Improving performance of state agencies and local public authorities to prevent abuse and violence among children through a series of suggested activities, including various databases on disadvantaged families, registration of children of migrant workers. Monitoring showed that in districts there are lists of children in difficult life conditions. Such item of the Plan as "Implementation of the Pilot Project "School without Violence", which showed its usefulness and relevance in prevention of violence among students, is not feasible.

Section of the Action Plan " Ensuring availability and increasing efficiency of assistance in cases of abuse and violence against children" is declarative due to lack of trained professionals to assist children, victims of violence, not only locally, but also in districts; services at the local level, program of teaching children skills of protection against abuse and violence.

The monitoring group notes that the plan for prevention of abuse and violence against children is largely formal, there are no sources and amounts of financing for activities, indicators for monitoring and evaluation. All this is reflected in implementation plan and adopted district interagency plans have a formal character.

3.1.2. Implementation of Regulation No. 391 on the Procedure for identification of families and children in difficult life situations.

One of mechanisms of identification and social support for all territorial bodies and local public authorities is Regulation No. 391 on the Procedure for identification of families and children in difficult life situations, adopted on June 22, 2015. For implementation of this Regulation, district interagency plans have been adopted.

Monitoring shows that, at the local level, there are different approaches to preparation of interagency plans at district level within the same oblast. For example, in a number of districts, interagency Action Plan for prevention of abuse and violence

against children and the Plan for identification and social support of families and children in difficult life conditions are combined into one overall Plan of the District. In other districts within the same oblast, there are separate interagency plans for identification and social support along with interagency Action Plan for prevention of abuse and violence against children. Along with this, the monitoring group notes that in 20% of surveyed districts there are no interagency district plans for identification and social support of children and families in difficult life conditions, indicating that not enough executive discipline on part of competent authorities for protection of children and families, heads of local public administrations, local state administrations, as well as on part of the Commission on children's affairs.

Availability of plans on revealing at local level

The monitoring group reviewed a presence of plans for identification of families and children in difficult life situations at the local level. During monitoring, the following results have been obtained: in 30% of ayil okmotu there were no such plans, indicating that local public authorities are not sufficiently involved in identification of families and children in difficult life conditions, although they were transferred responsibilities on identification.

Due to the fact that issues of identification of families and children in difficult life conditions, providing an initial social assistance are related to local public authorities, members of monitoring group are interested, how Social Affairs Commissions are involved in the process.

According to Model Regulations of Social Affairs Commission at executive local public authorities¹, it is a collegial body, operating on a periodic basis. The role and importance of Social Affairs Commissions are big, because they should provide social assistance at the primary level to families and children in difficult life conditions. However, not in all ayil okmoty there are such commissions.

In the presence of Social Affairs Commission in Bishkek, issues of support families and children in difficult life conditions are not addressed, but only issues of wastes, roads, etc. Issues on children are submitted to the district level, while they could be solved at the local level. For example, issues of children not attending school, absence of documents, etc.

Availability of Record Books of families and children in difficult life situations

The monitoring group notes that in each district there are Record Books of families and children in difficult life conditions, with an exception of Bakai-Ata district of Talas oblast. In addition, many respondents use the old form of Record Book, although in accordance with the Regulations, a new form of Record Book has been introduced. In some districts, Record Book of families and children in difficult life conditions is maintained not in accordance with the Regulations.

By Record Books of cases of violence among children in the system of Ministry of Internal Affairs/youth liaison services, cases are registered in RBC (Record Book of Crimes), documents are presented in the form of acts of seizures and reports on activities.

¹ Resolution of the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic from May 21, 2014, No. 264

Availability of questionnaires of comprehensive assessment of situation of child and family.

The monitoring group notes that, in spite of conducted training for employees of district management units of social development on implementation of the Regulations on identification and social support, local employees set a low value to completing questionnaires of comprehensive assessment of situation of child and family, qualified completing of which directly affects the development of Programs of Individual Work with Family and Individual Child Protection Plans. It is not possible to develop work plans for family and child, if comprehensive assessment of needs is not made, because a questionnaire of comprehensive assessment is the basis for development of Programs of Individual Work with Family and Individual Child Protection Plans. In practice, employees make them, on the basis of overall situation, without researching needs of families and children. As a result, we get unfinished child protection plans or plans for family care, which will be also poorly executed. Besides this, employees of Departments of Protection of Families and Children use old forms, for example, fill in an initial assessment, which is already excluded from proposed forms according to Regulation No. 391.

In 55% of authorized child protection agencies, in development of Programs of Individual Work with Family and Individual Child Protection Plans, we do not see questionnaires of comprehensive assessment of needs of families and children in departments. Below we present results of monitoring:

In remaining 45% of territorial bodies, questionnaires of comprehensive assessment have been provided. The Monitoring Group was interested in questions: What services are involved in completing questionnaires of comprehensive assessment? We could observe that filling of questionnaires of comprehensive assessment is carried out mainly by specialists of District Management Units of Social Development of Ministry of Labor and Social Development.

Monitoring has shown that responsible employee of District Management Unit of Social Development of Ministry of Labor and Social Development for maintaining the social event of family and child is assigned not in all districts. For example, in Moscow district of Chui oblast and in Balykchi town of Issyk-Kul oblast, an oral order of the head (hard to track responsibility) is given, and in Uzgen district, Kara-Kuldja district of Osh oblast, as well as in Jayil district, the work on implementation of Programs of Individual Work with Family and Individual Child Protection Plans is being done by all department, but mostly by Head of District Management Unit of Social Development of Ministry of Labor and Social Development.

In general, the monitoring group notes that Programs of Individual Work with Family and Individual Child Protection Plans are filled formally, incomplete conclusions are given, because they skip an important stage – filling a questionnaire of comprehensive assessment. Then, plans themselves are not always agreed with family, monitoring of implementation of plans or dynamics of changes is not conducted properly.

The number of identified cases of violence.

As members of the monitoring group note, the greatest difficulties during monitoring rise with obtaining information about the number of cases of child abuse. Firstly, there is no clear idea what should be referred to violence – as a rule, talking about violence, respondents counted only cases of sexual violence in the district or the most severe cases of physical violence. Such facts of neglecting needs of child, as failure to provide an access to education, abandonment, begging, employment of children in the worst forms of child labor, they refer just as difficult life situations. Victims of racketeering are also not counted as victims of violence, youth liaison services fix facts/cases of racketeering.

Secondly, there is no uniform approach to registration of cases of violence in documents.

According to presented data, for reporting period, in 28 of 40 districts, 157 cases of violence and abuse of children have been identified, which were registered in record books.

The largest number of identified cases of abuse has been registered in Bishkek – 52 cases (Oktyabrsky district - 13, Pervomaysky – 5, Leninsky - 14, Sverdlovsky - 20); in Talas oblast - 40 cases (Kara-Buura district – 4, Bakai-Ata district район -3).

in Chui oblast – 26 cases (Alamudun district – 2, Issyk-Ata – 4, Chui – 1, Sokuluk – 9, Panfilovskiy – 3, Kemin – 7).

Then Osh oblast – 14 cases (Kara-Kuldja district - 6, Uzgen district - 2, Osh town - 2, Kara-Suu town – 2, Aravan district - 2);

Issyk-Kul oblast – 10 cases (Tyup district – 3, Aksu – 2, Issyk-Kul – 5 (all cases of sexual violence));

Batken oblast – 9 cases (Batken district – 4 , Kyzyl-Kiya – 5);

Naryn oblast - 6 cases Naryn town – 2, At-Bashy district – 3, Naryn district – 1).

And the smallest number of identified cases is in Jalal-Abad oblast – 2 cases (Jalal-Abad town – 1, Bazar-Korgon – 1);

Registration of cases of violence is carried out, but there is no uniform approach. For example, in Bishkek: in Pervomaysky and Leninsky districts, there is a common record book of registration of difficult life situations, in Oktyabrky district there is a record book of registration and documents on victims of ill-treatment, in Sverdlovsky district, each social worker maintains a separate record book on difficult life situations at served territory.

Number of cases on violence, considered at the meetings of Commission on Children's Affairs for six months

All cases for families and children in difficult life situations are submitted to the Commission of Children's Affairs, with the exception of closed cases of sexual violence. Meetings of the Commission of Children's Affairs are held at least once per week (in Bishkek), in exceptional cases the Commission is convened in an extraordinary manner. Also offsite meetings of the Commission of Children's Affairs are convened.

In some districts, there were no cases of detection of violence among children, and thus, at the meetings of the Commission of Children's Affairs there was no such agenda. The monitoring group notes that not all identified cases of violence among children were considered at meetings of the Commission of Children's Affairs. We saw a discrepancy in number of detected cases and number of considered cases.

Bishkek, Oktyabrsky district – 24 issues, of which 10 cases of violence,
Panfilovsky district – 11 meetings, of which – 1 case of violence;
Naryn town – 11 meetings, of which – 1 case of violence;
At-Bashy district – 2 meetings, of which 2 cases of violence;
Alamudun district - 11 meetings, of which – 1 case of violence;
Leninskiy district – 33 cases, 15 cases of violence;
Issky-Ata district – 4 meetings, of which 1 case of violence;
Sverdlovsky district – 32 meetings, of which 3 cases of violence;
Kemin district – 5 meetings, of which 2 cases of violence;
Bishkek, Pervomaysky district – 16 meetings, of which 15 cases of violence.

Availability of acts of seizures

In seizures of children, in all districts, acts of seizures are drawn in mandatory manner. Prosecutor's office, parents, the Commission of Children's Affairs are notified. One copy of the act is kept in district management units of social development of Ministry of Labor and Social Development and youth liaison services.

The largest number of seizures of children from families in cases of abuse or in cases of neglecting basis needs was in Bishkek. Pervomaysky district 38 seizures (56 children); Sverdlovsky district – 19 seizures; Oktyabrsky district – 10 seizures; Leninskiy district – 9 seizures (18 children). In city, in cases of seizures, there is a possibility to accommodate children in various centers of temporary stay. For regions, in cases of seizures, the issue of accommodation of children is problematic because of lack of any centers or adoptive parents, who could take children, exposed to violence or negligence.

3.2. Conclusions

- Monitoring covered 40 districts, including 27 ayil okmotu. Respondents, participated in the survey, represent various public bodies at the level of districts and local public authorities, working with families and children in difficult life situations. The survey showed that, almost in all regions, immediately after adoption of documents – Resolution of the Government of the KR on prevention of violence on children and Regulation on procedure for identification of children and families in difficult life situations – active work started, which helped to focus on problems in protection of children from violence. Almost all respondents note that adopted documents have helped to organize the work in this direction at the local level. Many heads of state agencies become more aware that violence and abuse of children is not only deal of workers of management units of social development, but it is a problem of all public bodies, including local public

authorities and society as a whole. Interdepartmental problems of solving cases of violence against children and problems of resolving situation with families in difficult life conditions have been almost reduced to a minimum. In all state agencies at the district level (100%) and in 85.2 % of local public authorities there are folders with state programs, regulatory legal acts, regulations, departmental and local orders for prevention of child abuse. Thus, experts at the local level are informed about legislation and measures of state policy on rights of protection from violence and abuse, as well as about the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child. However, information about Regulation No. 391 on procedure for identification of children and families in difficult life situations is not given to all structures of districts (Local Education Authorities, Family Practice Centers, Youth Liaison Services and others) and to all employees of district management unit of social development.

- After the adoption of the Regulation, responsibility and interagency coordination of heads of local public authorities, medical institutions, state registration services, law enforcement and other state agencies, which were previously considered that problems of children and families in difficult life conditions are concerned only management units of social development, schools, parents themselves and their families. It should be noted that work in this area is not adjusted equally, there are districts, where formally concerned to this problem, there are districts, where came to its decision with full responsibility. Almost in each district, plans of joint actions are developed.
- Results of monitoring revealed the need to organize and optimize of regulatory legal acts on children and families in difficult life conditions, as many duplicate documents on child protection are issued, which require taking identical measures at the local level. Given limited resources, including human, at the local level, duplicate plans of work on implementation of tasks in state agencies at the local level and local public authorities are developed, but none of the plans are not implemented in full.
- In accordance with the Decree of the Government of KR of March 25, No. 125-p, in all district state administrations and local public authorities there are approved interagency Action Plans to prevent child abuse and violence against children in 2015-2017, on the basis of which, measures are being taken for prevention of ill-treatment of children. Plans, approved by head and mayors of cities, are distributed to appropriate services and ayil okmotu. There are also Action Plans of district state administration on implementation of the program on juvenile justice for 2014-2018, No. 42-6.
- Main information raising activities for prevention of violence among children are conducted more at the level of educational organizations. This practice is observed in all regions. There is a practice of discussions on prevention of violence among children at village meetings only in Chui oblast. There are isolated cases of awareness raising activities at the district level.

- In the local media, radio and television programs, positive examples of family values, responsible attitude to child education, practically are not used, rural clubs and libraries practically are not involved in formation of family values and inadmissibility of child abuse.
- Monitoring showed that Ministry of Labor and Social Development of the KR, jointly with International Labor Organization conducted training of employees of district state management units of social development of 6 oblasts, as well as secretaries of Youth Liaison Services on implementation of Regulation No. 391 on the Procedure for identification of families and children in difficult life situations, including the category of children, victims and witnesses of violence, but this training is not sufficient. Specialists noted that they need in targeted training with participation of psychologists and medical workers.
- Almost in all district state management units of social development, social workers do not have special education and related work experience not only with children, but also with regulations, and as a result, do not fully understand what are their main functions and tasks. Workers often cannot even prepare a work plan, a progress report, etc. One of main reasons for this problem is low level of salary.
- Plan for prevention of abuse and violence against children is largely formal because of lack of funding sources and sizes for activities, indicators for monitoring and assessment, trained specialists to assist children – victims of violence not only at the local level, but also in districts, services at the local level, parent education programs and skills of protection from abuse and violence.
- In all districts, household surveys to identify children, who have experiences violence, are conducted, such form of complete survey of identifying requires time and human resources, which are always limited. Child abuse is largely a latent problem, and for identification, specialists, teachers, social teachers, police inspectors are needed, who may, by various criteria, determine the child at risk of violence or victims of violence or know families, in which abuse can occur.
- In addition to Bishkek and Karakol, for all districts, the problem of crisis centers, support centers for families and children, where qualified assistance to victims of violence may be provided, is relevant. The lack of specialists – psychologists, lawyers, therapists at the local level lead to the fact, that most of victims, witnesses of violence remain without adequate rehabilitation.
- In districts, at akimiats, head offices for elimination of violence against children are established, whose members are heads of structural divisions of the district (management unit of social development, District Departments of Internal Affairs, Health, Education, Municipal Territorial Administration. Regular meetings of head offices are conducted and minutes are taken, executive secretaries of head offices are responsible for documenting. There are no criteria for evaluating the effectiveness of work of head offices.

- A scheme or algorithm of response and interagency cooperation in cases of child abuse for district services is developed by Bishkek City Department for Social Development. This scheme is approved by City Mayor's Office and distributed for all district services, involved in work with children.
- There are no Interagency Plan for identification and social support of families and children in difficult life conditions in all districts, indicating the absence of purposeful work on identification and organization of support of children and families in difficult life conditions in these districts and not enough executive discipline on part of competent authorities for protection of children and families.
- At the local level, in 30% of ayil okmotu there were no plans, indicating that local public authorities are not sufficiently involved in identification of families and children in difficult life conditions, although they were transferred responsibilities on identification. There are Social Affairs Commissions not in all ayil okmoty. Practice shows that Social Affairs Commissions do not pay enough attention to issues on identification and social support of families and children in difficult life conditions. In the presence of Social Affairs Commission in Bishkek, issues of support families and children in difficult life conditions are not addressed, but only issues of wastes, roads, etc. Such situation complicates and increases the work of district management units of social development, because any issues on children are submitted to the district level, while they could be solved at the local level. For example, issues of children not attending school, absence of documents, etc.
- In some districts, there are mobile multidisciplinary teams that include employees of district management units of social development, youth liaison services, Municipal Territorial Administrations on an ongoing basis, as well as employees of health and education systems as necessary. But, in a third of surveyed districts, there are no interdisciplinary teams. This situation directly affects the quality of filled in questionnaires of comprehensive assessment and Programs of Individual Work with Family and Individual Child Protection Plans, i.e. it is difficult to assess the needs of families and children in difficult life situations without help of specialists;
- In some Municipal Territorial Administrations (in Bishkek), special working groups or committees to combat violence in family, which are working to identify and help children and families in difficult life conditions. There are no criteria for evaluating the effectiveness of work of committees and working groups.
- Despite the fact that in almost of all districts there are Record Books of families and children in difficult life conditions, there is no single approach to fill in record books. In some districts, record books are filled according to the old form. There is no also uniform approach in registration of cases of violence. District

Management Units of Social Development record cases of violence or in record books of phone calls of telephone reassurance service at akimiats or in general record books on difficult life conditions (this could be one record book for the district, or it could be record book of each social worker of District Management Units of Social Development by families in difficult life conditions).

- In spite of conducted training for employees of district management units of social development on implementation of the Regulations on identification and social support, local employees set a low value to completing questionnaires of comprehensive assessment of situation of child and family, qualified completing of which directly affects the development of Programs of Individual Work with Family and Individual Child Protection Plans. In 55% of authorized child protection agencies, in development of Programs of Individual Work with Family and Individual Child Protection Plans, questionnaires of comprehensive assessment of needs of families and children in departments were not provided. The monitoring group notes the lack of work of District Management Unit of Social Development on completing Programs of Individual Work with Family and Individual Child Protection Plans.
- Monitoring has shown that responsible employee of District Management Unit of Social Development for social support of case of violence in family and child, victim or witness of violence, is assigned not in all. A specialist is not always assigned for implementation of Programs of Individual Work with Family and Individual Child Protection Plans, there is a practice, when the whole department is working on it or head of the department performs the work.
- In general, the monitoring group notes that Programs of Individual Work with Family and Individual Child Protection Plans are filled formally, incomplete conclusions are given, because they skip an important stage – filling a questionnaire of comprehensive assessment. Then, plans themselves are not always agreed with family, monitoring of implementation of plans or dynamics of changes is not conducted properly.
- At the local level, there is no clear idea what should be referred to violence – as a rule, talking about violence, respondents counted only cases of sexual violence in the district or the most severe cases of physical violence. Such facts of neglecting needs of child, as failure to provide an access to education, abandonment, begging, employment of children in the worst forms of child labor, they refer just to difficult life situations. Victims of racketeering are also not counted as victims of violence.
- All cases for families and children in difficult life situations are submitted to the Commission of Children's Affairs, with the exception of closed cases of sexual violence.

- Local budgets do not allocate funds to address problems of families and children in difficult life conditions. Due to lack of financing, developed and adopted plans are not fully realized, there is practically no monitoring of their implementation at the local level, tracking of solving the problems. Plans themselves are developed formally, do not contain any indicators.
- Organization of effective social work at the local level requires additional resources for transport, communication, stationery and office supplies, etc. It is not possible to speak about effectiveness of social services without addressing issues of necessary resources.

Recommendations

- It is necessary to improve the capacity and conduct training of all professionals, involved in the system of child protection, including specialist of local public authorities, deputies of local councils, specialists of state bodies at the system level, starting from checking the knowledge of fundamentals of legislation to application of instruments of support and protection of children in practice, increasing their awareness of regulatory and legal acts, relating protection of children and families. It is recommended to conduct training on a regular basis and at the system level, attractive resources of donors, NGOs, universities, etc.
- Social workers should undergo regular further training courses to develop skills of indicative planning, work with regulations and above all for filling the following documents: Record Book of children and families in difficult life situations, Questionnaire of overall assessment of problems of families in difficult life situations, Programs of Individual Work with Family and Individual Child Protection Plans.
- It is recommended to develop a Toolkit on interagency interaction on protection of families and children in difficult life conditions, where clearly determine and describe steps and actions of all involved organizations in identification and support of children and families in difficult life conditions – what cases can be addressed and resolved at the level of ayil okmotu and what cases forward to departments of protection of families and children of management units of social development of districts. At that, to develop a single form for submitting information about children and families in difficult life conditions. Approve the unified form of act of social and living conditions of family.
- It is recommended to simplify an application form of Questionnaire of comprehensive assessment of problems of families and children in difficult life situations. Information should be collected as much as it then be used in practical work. The current questionnaire is excessive. Given limited resources, the feasibility of collecting such array of information is very low. For children, it is recommended to develop and fill out forms by categories: children without parental care, children with disabilities, working children, children, who are subjected to violence, as there is a lack of knowledge, then such questionnaire will help to identify the child's needs.

- It is recommended to use not only household survey and raids to identify children, who have experienced violence. Child abuse is largely a latent problem, and it is quite difficult to identify it by traditional methods. It is necessary to train professionals, especially employees of educational institutions and kindergartens, to methods and tools of work, where it can be determined, by special signs, the child in risk of abuse or exposed to violence.
- It is recommended to strengthen the awareness-rising work among population about timely providing information about children in difficult life situation;
- Local development programs must have sections related to improving the quality of life of its population and specific measures to address problems of families, especially those in difficult life situations. It is recommended to provide in local budget of ayil okmoty the expense item for children and families in difficult life situations and develop provisions for assistance and support such children and families.
- It is recommended to develop plans of information- and outreach to promote family values at the local level, development of impatience with violence and developing skills of responsible parenthood. Step up an awareness raising campaign on prevention of abuse and violence against children at the levels of districts and local public authorities, using different forms of work. To this end, actively involve mass media.
- Strengthen activities of Commissions on Social Affairs at the local level to assist families and children, contact district management units of social development only in difficult cases.